



Schenectady Historic District Commission

Meeting Minutes
April 23, 2020

I. CALL TO ORDER

Commissioner Yager called the meeting to order at 7:05 p.m.

Due to the closure of City Hall because of the Covid-19 Virus, the meeting was conducted online via WebEx.

II. ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Patricia Yager, Chair; Shaun Andriano; Dr. Dean Bennett; Frank Gilmore; Christopher Marney

STAFF: Matt Smith, Senior Planner; Jennifer Mills, Secretary

EXCUSED: Ben Wiles, Vice Chair

III. CONFLICT OF INTEREST

None.

IV. ADOPTION OF MEETING MINUTES

Motion by Commissioner Andriano, seconded by Commissioner Marney, to approve the February 27, 2020 Meeting Minutes as submitted.

Motion carried unanimously.

V. APPLICATIONS

A. Consideration for approval submitted by Deonarine Nandlall to install new windows. The premises are located at 1024 Wendell Avenue in the Union Triangle Historic District.

Deonarine Nandlall presented the application.

Mr. Nandlall stated that he had amended his previous application from February 2020, which was to replace all of the windows in the house with vinyl windows. He explained that his new application is for permission to replace the windows on the front of the house and those numbered as 9, 10, 13, and 14 on the included photo with aluminum clad wood windows, and to replace the windows on the remainder of the building with vinyl windows.

Commissioner Bennett stated that he had no objection to the use of vinyl windows on the rear of the house or the back window of the side bump out windows (numbers 12 and 16) although he would have concerns about how having the different types of windows on the bow windows would look from the interior of the house. Commissioner Yager agreed, stating that for aesthetic purposes she believes the windows in the bump out should all be the same, but thinks that because windows 12 and 16 are not really visible from the right of way they are arguably not within the Commission's purview. Commissioner Gilmore expressed concerns regarding the installation of replacement windows and stated that any new windows should be set back 1 ½ to 2 inches from the plane of the side of the house, as they would have been originally, so as to maintain the historic look of the façade. Commissioner Andriano agreed, stating that the windows should be installed without the insulation flange and with the suggested setback.

Commissioner Marney stated that the Commission has never approved vinyl windows where they are visible from the right of way, and he would not support approving them as requested in this application. He added that at the February 2020 meeting the Commissioners and the applicant had engaged in a lengthy conversation regarding saving the windows that could be repaired where at all possible, especially on the front façade of the house, as is required by the standards and guidelines that the Commission is charged with upholding. He stated that he does not believe that the applicant has submitted sufficient evidence that the windows are beyond repair and must be replaced, particularly on the front of the house. The Commissioners indicated that they agreed with Commissioner Marney's comments. Mr. Nandlall stated that he had investigated repairing the windows, but the cost would be close to that of replacement, and new windows would be more energy efficient. Commissioner Gilmore stated that using the original wood storm windows would give energy efficiency comparable to a replacement window. Commissioner Marney stated that the cost of repair versus replacement is not a consideration within the standards that the Commission must follow.

The Commissioners discussed the replacement of the front façade windows and it was decided that the windows and storms on the front façade should be repaired, as Mr. Nandlall had failed to prove that they must be replaced.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

RESOLUTION

Motion by Commissioner Andriano, seconded by Commissioner Marney, to approve as submitted the application to install new windows, with the following modifications and conditions:

1. The project will be completed within one year.

2. The windows and storm windows on the front of the house, numbers 1-8 as indicated on the submitted numbered photo, will not be replaced but will be repaired and repainted.
3. Windows 9, 10, 11, 13, 14, 15, 17, 18, and 19 may be replaced with Pella Lifestyle aluminum clad wood windows, as specified in the application. The windows will be installed without the insulation flange and will be set back 1 ½ to 2 inches, with the appropriate flashing, so as to resemble the placement of the original windows.
4. All windows that are not visible from the right of way, including windows numbered 12 and 16 and those on the back of the house, may be replaced with vinyl. The Commission strongly recommends that windows 12 and 16, the windows on the rear side of the bump outs, be replaced with aluminum clad wood windows for aesthetic purposes.

And with the following findings of fact:

1. This is a Type II SEQRA.
2. The Commission believes that the applicant has not provided adequate evidence to prove that the windows on the front of the house (1-8 as indicated on the included diagram) cannot be repaired and must be removed. Therefore, they have not approved the replacement of these windows.

Motion carried unanimously.

B. Consideration for approval submitted by Edward Remillard on behalf of Steven Burkholder to replace the roof. The premises are located at 1044 University Place in the Union Triangle Historic District.

Edward Remillard presented the application.

Mr. Remillard explained that the roof is in very bad repair and need to be replaced. Commissioner Yager asked if there is existing sheathing and if it needs repair. Mr. Remillard replied that there is existing sheathing and it is in the contract to replace it as needed, although it appears to be in fairly good shape. Commissioner Yager asked what color the drip edge will be. Mr. Remillard stated that it will be white, to blend with the trim color of the house.

The Commissioners indicated that they had no objection to the proposed shingles.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

RESOLUTION

Motion by Commissioner Marney, seconded by Commissioner Gilmore, to approve as submitted the application to replace the roof with architectural shingles in the proposed Patriot Slate color, with the following conditions:

1. The project will be completed within one year.
2. The drip edge will be white to match the trim of the building.

And with the following finding of fact:

1. This is a Type II SEQRA.

Motion carried unanimously.

C. Consideration for approval submitted by Haley Priebe to install new windows. The premises are located at 35 North Ferry Street in the Stockade Historic District.

Haley Priebe presented the application.

Ms. Priebe briefly reviewed her application, explaining that she would like to replace the existing storefront windows, which were most likely originally installed as replacement windows in the mid-twentieth century, with new aluminum clad wood storefront windows from the Andersen E-Series in Mallard Green. She noted that the proposed windows will have a transom which will provide added ventilation while also more closely resembling what appears to be the original windows shown in the historic photo provided in the application. She added that she would like the far left window to have a sliding pane, as noted on the plans, to allow for walk-up takeout of coffee and ice cream.

Commissioner Andriano commented that the historic photo shows a header between the bottom portion of the window and the transom, and asked Ms. Priebe if she had given any thought to replacing the header. Ms. Priebe stated that the new windows have quite a significant divider at that point, which is likely not shown as prominently in the schematic drawings as it will appear once installed. The Commissioners and Ms. Priebe discussed the placement of the transoms across the door and the two sets of windows on both sides, and whether or not it is preferable that they line up. Ms. Priebe stated that SHPO has commented that they prefer that the two sets of windows do not line up with each other, so as to make it clear that there are still two distinct buildings making up the storefront. Commissioner Andriano stated that in some applications when the difference is too small it can look like an unintended mistake. Ms. Priebe stated that she is working with SHPO to make sure that the window configuration looks appropriate.

Commissioner Marney stated that he would have no objection to the replacement windows as the existing windows are not historic. He added that he does not

believe that the unobtrusive takeout window would in any way significantly detract from the historic façade. The other Commissioners agreed.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

RESOLUTION

Motion by Commissioner Andriano, seconded by Commissioner Gilmore, to approve as submitted the application to install new Andersen E-Series aluminum clad wood storefront windows in Mallard Green, with the following condition:

1. The project will be completed within one year.

And with the following finding of fact:

1. This is a Type II SEQRA.

Motion carried unanimously.

D. Consideration for approval submitted by Danielle Tillilie to paint the building. The premises are located at 205 Green Street in the Stockade Historic District.

Danielle Tillilie presented the application.

Ms. Tillilie explained that she has recently purchased the property and is working to restore it. She stated that she would like to permanently remove the shutters as they were not original to the house as evidenced by the historic photo provided and the fact that two of the second story windows do not have sufficient space to accommodate two shutter between them. The Commissioners agreed that the shutters should be removed.

Commissioner Bennett asked if Ms. Tillilie has tested that paint color and is sure that it will not be too dark. Ms. Tillilie responded that she has tested the color on the house and it actually dries significantly lighter than the photo provided. The Commissioners indicated that they have no objection to the proposed color.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

RESOLUTION

Motion by Commissioner Bennett, seconded by Commissioner Andriano, to approve as submitted the application to paint the exterior of the building and permanently remove the shutters, with the following conditions:

1. The project will be completed within one year.

2. The body of the house will be painted Behr Very Navy (M500-7).

And with the following findings of fact:

1. This is a Type II SEQRA.
2. As proven in the historic photos provided the shutters were not original to the house and therefore the Commission supports their permanent removal.

Motion carried unanimously.

E. Consideration for approval submitted by Krishna Govindarajan to install new garage doors. The premises are located at 1121 Adams Road in the GE Realty Plot Historic District.

Krishna Govindarajan presented the application.

Mr. Govindarajan explained that he had received permission from the Commission in the spring of 2014 to replace his garage doors in kind with wood doors. He stated that he replaced that doors at that time and over the course of the next few years the doors quickly deteriorated due to issues with water pooling in front of the garage. He stated that because of these issues he is seeking permission to replace the doors with steel doors. Mr. Govindarajan noted that the proposed doors will look very similar to the existing doors, with plain windows along the top row of the doors.

Commissioner Yager asked Mr. Govindarajan if he has looked into a better drainage system to mitigate the water problem, as she is concerned not only about the doors but the stucco finish and even the structure of the garage. Mr. Govindarajan replied that he has spoken with a contractor about installing a drain system, but the cost of running drainage all the way to the street from the garage, which is set back towards the rear of the property, was an estimated \$8,000 to \$10,000. Commissioner Andriano stated that he agreed with Commissioner Yager, explaining that a water problem of this magnitude could threaten the garage structure as a whole. He suggested looking into a different kind of drain perhaps in front of the garage and encouraged Mr. Govindarajan to investigate other potential solutions. Mr. Govindarajan agreed that the water problem should be addressed.

Commissioner Andriano stated that his only reservation with the metal door is that it cannot be painted, so the applicant must be certain about keeping the chosen color over the long term. After some discussion it was decided to leave it up to Mr. Govindarajan to decide whether he preferred the door in the almond color or white.

Commissioner Bennett stated that he would have no objection to the introduction of the new material in this case as he believes that the applicant has provided sufficient evidence to prove that the wood doors are not suitable for this

application. The Commissioners agreed. Commissioner Yager stated that the applicant has proven that the wood doors are not sustainable. Commissioner Marney urged Mr. Govindarajan to further investigate drainage solutions to protect the integrity of the garage. Mr. Govindarajan assured him that he will.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

RESOLUTION

Motion by Commissioner Marney, seconded by Commissioner Andriano, to approve as submitted the application to install new garage doors, with the following conditions:

1. The project will be completed within one year.
2. The applicant may choose either the white or almond color of the door style and design included in the application – Amarr Lincoln LI 3138 – with the plain windows with no inserts.

And with the following findings of fact:

1. This is a Type II SEQRA.
2. In accordance with Standard 7, the Commission accepts the applicant's evidence that wood garage doors, such as those that were installed six years ago, will not be useful for their intended lifespan in this application because of the problem of water pooling in the driveway at their base. It is for this reason that the Commission feels it appropriate to approve the alternate metal material for the doors. The Commission has also urged the applicant to investigate installing a drainage system to mitigate the water problem and protect the integrity of the garage.

Motion carried unanimously.

F. Consideration for approval submitted by Ron Gardner to paint the building. The premises are located at 308 Green Street in the Stockade Historic District.

Ron Gardner presented the application.

Mr. Gardner explained that he had decided on an exterior color for the building, which is nearing completion, and it is Country Redwood from the Benjamin Moore Historic Collection.

The Commissioners indicated that they have no objection to the color. They congratulated Mr. Gardner for taking on this large project and successfully seeing it through to the end.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

RESOLUTION

Motion by Commissioner Andriano, seconded by Commissioner Gilmore, to approve as submitted the application to paint the exterior of the building, with the following conditions:

1. The project will be completed within one year.
2. The body of the house will be painted Country Red (HC-183) from the Benjamin Moore Historic Collection.

And with the following finding of fact:

3. This is a Type II SEQRA.

Motion carried unanimously.

VI. MISCELLANEOUS

None.

VII. ADJOURNMENT

Motion by Commissioner Gilmore, seconded by Commissioner Bennett, to adjourn the meeting.

Motion carried unanimously.

The meeting was adjourned at 8:32 p.m.